DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

HARRY GURAL, Tenant/Petitioner,

v.

EQUITY RESIDENTIAL MANAGEMENT Housing Provider/Respondent.

Case No.: 2016 DHCD TP 30.855

3003 Van Ness Street, N.W. Apt. S-707 Administrative Law Judge: M. Colleen Currie

TENANT'S REPLY TO HOUSING PROVIDER'S BRIEF REGARDING LACHES

I, Harry Gural (the "Tenant"), acting *pro se*, hereby submit my reply to Equity Residential's (the "Housing Provider") Brief Regarding Laches.

The question of the proper court for a Laches argument is outside my area of expertise. However, the Housing Provider's delay in filing of its case in Landlord and Tenant Court is informative in the Tenant Petition before the Office of Administrative Hearings.

The word "rent" is clearly defined in DC Rental Housing Code section §42-3501.03 (28) and it applies to all of chapter 35. According to the statute:

'Rent' means the entire amount of money, money's worth, benefit, bonus, or gratuity demanded, received, or charged by a housing provider as a condition of occupancy or use of a rental unit, its related services, and its related facilities. [DC Code section §42-3501.03 (28)]

For the period between April 1, 2015 and March 31, 2016, the Tenant paid the Housing Provider \$1,830 plus \$100 parking (See Exhibit A). The Housing Provider accepted that amount as full payment for the occupancy of the rental unit, as evidenced by the fact that it took no legal action against the Tenant during that period.

The tenant reasonably relied on this lack of legal action or complaint by the Housing Provider to confirm that his rent for that year was \$1,830 (plus \$100 parking). When planning financial decisions he reasonably believed that the next year's rent would be limited to the

maximum legal increase under the DC Rental Housing Code—2% plus the CPI-W. However, on Jan. 21, 2016 the Housing Provider demanded a rent increase that exceeded the maximum legal increase by \$297 (See Exhibit B). This increase would amount to \$3,564 per year.

In the year beginning April 1, 2016, the Tenant refused to pay the \$297 rent increase demanded by the Housing Provider. His first payment of the new year on March 23 included the maximum legal increase, totaling \$1,885 plus \$100 for parking (See Exhibit C). Thirty-three days later on April 25, 2016 the Housing Provider filed a Verified Complaint for Possession of Real Property in the Landlord and Tenant Branch of the DC Superior Court, claiming that it had not been paid in full (See Exhibit D).

Because the Housing Provider accepted as full payment of rent the amount the Tenant paid during the first year (April 2014—March 2015), it now cannot claim that the rent during that period was in fact higher than the rent that was paid. It also cannot claim that it is owed a rent increase for the following year that is \$297 higher than the maximum amount allowable under the DC Rental Housing Code.

The Tenant indeed has paid a price for the Housing Provider's failure to pursue legal action in April 2015 when the Housing Provider should have first sought a remedy if it believed that the Tenant was not meeting his financial obligation as a condition of occupancy of the rental unit. The Tenant is now paying \$297 per month under a Protective Order because the Housing Provider did not take legal action at that time but later demanded an illegal rent increase.

Furthermore, the Housing Provider accrues immense benefit by delaying its case in Landlord and Tenant Court because in effect it delays by one year the time in which the Tenant filed a Tenant Petition in the Office of Administrative Hearings. As the President of the Tenants Association representing tenants of 3003 Van Ness, the Tenant will attest under the penalty of perjury that over 60 tenants have sought his help in preventing the Housing Provider from demanding of them illegal rent increases that exceed what is permitted under

the DC Rental Housing statute. Because those tenants fear seeking a remedy in the courts because of the great cost of a legal battle with a \$23 billion corporation and its corporate attorneys, and because of fear of retaliation (the Housing Provider has evicted a tenant for non-payment if an illegal rent increase) the Housing Provider likely earned more than half a million dollars (at a conservative estimate--\$1,000 per year x 600 apartments) by overcharging tenants in the 600+ apartments at 3003 Van Ness during the year delay.

The doctrine of Laches reveals an inconsistency in the Housing Provider's claim of what constitutes rent. In the first year, it accepted the entire amount charged as a condition of occupancy or use of a rental unit was \$1,830. The Housing Provider now claims that the "real" rent that year was several hundred dollars a month higher than the amount paid, and now claims a rent increase that exceeds by \$297 the maximum allowable amount under DC Rental Housing Law.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing Tenant's Reply to the Housing Provider's Brief Regarding Laches was served on this 11th day of February by first-class mail, postage prepaid and by email upon:

Richard W. Luchs (D.C. Bar No. 243931) Joshua M. Greenberg (D.C. Bar No. 489323) Debra F. Leege (D.C. Bar No. 497380) 1620 L Street, N.W. Suite 900 Washington, DC 20036-5605

> Harry Gural Tenant/Petitioner, pro se

2/11/17

EXHIBIT A

Crown Account Regular

Account number: 1010025493649 ■ February 27, 2015 - March 25, 2015 ■ Page 1 of 4



HARRY D GURAL 3003 VAN NESS ST NW APT S707 WASHINGTON DC 20008-4711

Questions?

Available by phone 24 hours a day, 7 days a week: Telecommunications Relay Services calls accepted

1-800-TO-WELLS (1-800-869-3557)

TTY: 1-800-877-4833 En español: 1-877-727-2932

華語 1-800-288-2288 (6 am to 7 pm PT, M-F)

Online: wellstargo.com

Write: Wells Fargo Bank, N.A. (389)

P.O. Box 6995

Portland, OR 97228-6995

You and Wells Fargo

Thank you for being a loyal Wells Fargo customer. We value your trust in our company and look forward to continuing to serve you with your financial needs.

Account options

A check mark in the box indicates you have these convenient services with your account(s). Go to wellsfargo.com or call the number above if you have questions or if you would like to add new services.

| Online Banking | 1 | Direct Deposit | 1 |
|--------------------|---|-----------------------|---|
| Online Bill Pay | 1 | Auto Transfer/Payment | 1 |
| Online Statements | 1 | Overdraft Protection | |
| Mobile Banking | | Debit Card | |
| My Spending Report | 1 | Overdraft Service | |

Activity summary

Beginning balance on 2/27
Deposits/Additions
Withdrawals/Subtractions
Ending balance on 3/25

Account number: 1010025493649
HARRY D GURAL

Washington, DC account terms and conditions apply

For Direct Deposit use

Routing Number (RTN): 054001220

Overdraft Protection

This account is not currently covered by Overdraft Protection. If you would like more information regarding Overdraft Protection and eligibility requirements please call the number listed on your statement or visit your Wells Fargo store.

(389) Sheet Seq = 0005969 Sheet 00001 of 00003



Transaction history

| | Check | | Deposits/ | Withdrawals/ | Ending daily |
|------------|--------------|--|--------------|----------------------------|------------------|
| Date | Number | Description | Additions | Subtractions | balance |
| 3/2 | | Recurring Transfer to Gural H Way 2 Save Savings Ref | | (80000) | G 1289180 |
| | | di-Opegbaw]114 xxxxx632% | | | |
| 3/3 | | Online Transfer From Gural H Way2Save Savings xxxxxx6327 Flor | SCHOOL STATE | | |
| | | CAIDESMEJKWC on 03/03/15 | | | |
| 3/3 | | Bill Pay Bardays Bank DE Recurringxxxxxxxxxxxx07995 on 03-03 | | (74.89 | |
| 3/3 | | Bill Pay Chase Card Servi Recurringxxxxxxxxxxxx37609 on 03-03 | | (00.00) | |
| 3/3 | | Bill Pay Chase Card Servi Recurringxxxxxxxxxx75225 on 03-03 | | 6:5000 0 | 5.614.91 |
| 3/5 | | this Senate Fed Salary 022815 xxxxx2309 Harry Gural | 03:838:22 | | c0.453.13 |
| 3/6 | t406 | Check | | 45:00 | 9 438.1 |
| 3/10 | | (Bill Pay Venzon Wireless Recurringxxxxxxxxxx00001 on 03-10) | | Q01122 | 9 438.18 |
| 3/17 | | (Bill Pay Barclay's Bank DE on-Line Xxxxxxxxxx07995 on 03.17 | | 04.59 | |
| 3/17 | | Bill Pay Ren Cable Recurringxxxxxxx84104 on 03 17 | | 122.21 | |
| 3/17 | | RIII Pay Chase Card Servi on Line Xxxxxxxxxx75225 on 03 17 | -57 | 2,000.06 | 7.079.81 |
| 3/20 | | US Scrate Fed Salary 031515 xxxxx2309 Harry Gural | 01838123 | Description of the last | fD 918 04 |
| 3/25 | | Bill Pay Equity Residenti on-Line xxxxxx07071 on 03-25 | | 1,930.00 | 8 988.04 |
| Ending bal | ance on 3/25 | A TOTAL CONTRACTOR OF THE PROPERTY OF THE PROP | | CONTRACTOR OF THE PARTY OF | 8038.04 |
| Totals | | | 0\$9,676,45 | \$6,278,21 | |

The Ending Daily Balance does not reflect any pending withdrawals or holds on deposited funds that may have been outstanding on your account when your transactions posted. If you had insufficient available funds when a transaction posted, fees may have been assessed.

Summary of checks written (checks listed are also displayed in the preceding Transaction history)

| Number | Date | Amount |
|--------|-------|----------|
| 040G | CEAD) | (115110) |

Monthly service fee summary

For a complete list of fees and detailed account information, please see the Wells Fargo Fee and Information Schedule and Account Agreement applicable to your account or talk to a banker. Go to wellsfargo.com/teefaq to find answers to common questions about the monthly service fee on your account.

| Fee period 02/27/2015 - 03/25/2015 | Standard monthly service fee \$12.00 | You paid \$0.00 |
|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------|
| How to avoid the monthly service fee | Minimum required | This fee period |
| Have any ONE of the following account requirements | | |
| Average daily balance | \$1,500.00 | \$8,528.00 |
| Monthly automatic payment to a Wells Fargo home mortgage | 1 | 0 🗆 |
| · Combined balances in linked accounts, which may include | \$2,500.00 | \$25,780.03 |
| Average daily balances in checking and savings accounts | | |
| · Combined balances in linked accounts, which may include | \$5,000.00 | \$0.00 |
| - Average daily balances in time accounts and FDIC-insured retirement acc | ounts | |
| · Combined balances in linked accounts, which may include | \$5,000.00 | \$0.00 |
| - Outstanding balances in consumer installment loans | | |
| - Line amount in credit cards and consumer lines of credit | | |
| JBJB | | |

Other Wells Fargo Benefits

We're committed to hiring military veterans. Visit wellsfargo.com/careers to find out how your military experience can translate to a rewarding career at Wells Fargo.*

EXHIBIT B

Smith Property Holdings Van Ness L.P. 3003 Van Ness Street NW Washington, DC 20008

District of Columbia Department of Housing and Community Development Housing Regulation Administration – Rental Accommodations Division (RAD) 1800 Martin Luther King Jr. Avenue SE, 2nd Floor Washington, DC 20020 (202) 442-9505

HOUSING PROVIDER'S NOTICE TO TENANTS OF ADJUSTMENT IN RENT CHARGED

Harry Gural 3003 Van Ness Street, N.W. Apt # S0707 Washington, DC 20008

IF YOU ARE ELDERLY OR DISABLED, CONTACT YOUR HOUSING PROVIDER TO COMPLETE A "NOTICE OF ELDERLY OR DISABLED STATUS" FORM, AND GIVE A COPY TO YOUR HOUSING PROVIDER. THIS FORM IS ALSO AVAILABLE FROM THE RENTAL ACCOMMODATIONS DIVISION.

Dear Tenants(s):

In accordance with the provisions of the Rental Housing Act of 1985, as amended (Act), the rent charged for your rental unit will be adjusted as set forth below:

| Your current rent charged is: | \$ 2,118 | | |
|--|------------|--|--|
| The dollar adjustment in your rent charged is: | \$ 74 | | |
| The percentage adjustment in your rent charged | 3.50 % | | |
| Your new rent charged is: | \$ 2,192 | | |
| The effective date is: | 04/01/2016 | | |

The basis of the adjustment in rent charged is as follows [check one]:

Under section 206(b) and 208(h) of the Act (D.C. OFFICIAL CODE §§ 42-3502.06(b) & 42-3502.08(h)(2) (Supp. 2008), the increase in rent charged is based on the increase in the Consumer Price Index (CPI-W). For tenants qualified under the Act as elderly or disabled, the maximum increase in rent charged is the lesser of the CPI-W percentage, or 5% of the current allowable rent changed. For other tenants, the maximum percentage increase in rent charged is the CPI-W percentage plus 2%, but the total increase shall not be more than 10% of the current allowable rent charged. The Rental Housing Commission (RHC) determines the annual adjustment of general applicability in the rent charged established by Section 206(b) for each Rental Unit, which shall be equal to the change during the previous calendar year in the Washington, D.C. Standard Metropolitan Statistical Area (SMSA) Consumer Price Index for Urban Wage Earners and Clerical Workers (CPI-W). The CPI-W percentage published by the Rental Housing Commission for May 2015 through April 2016 is 1.5%.

☐ Alternatively, a housing provider may seek an allowable rent adjustment under other provisions of the Act, including petitions based on capital improvements, changes in services and/or facilities, hardship, substantial rehabilitation or voluntary agreement with 70% of the tenants.

EXHIBIT C

Crown Account Regular

Account number: 1010025493649 February 26, 2016 - March 24, 2016 Page 1 of 3



HARRY D GURAL 3003 VAN NESS ST NW APT S707 WASHINGTON DC 20008-4711

Questions?

Available by phone 24 hours a day, 7 days a week: Telecommunications Relay Services calls accepted

1-800-TO-WELLS (1-800-869-3557)

TTY: 1-800-877-4833 En español: 1-877-727-2932

華語 1-800-288-2288 (6 am to 7 pm PT, M-F)

Online: wellsfargo.com

Write: Wells Fargo Bank, N.A. (389)

P.O. Box 6995

Portland, OR 97228-6995

You and Wells Fargo

Thank you for being a loyal Wells Fargo customer. We value your trust in our company and look forward to continuing to serve you with your financial needs.

Account options

A check mark in the box indicates you have these convenient services with your account(s). Go to wellstargo.com or call the number above if you have questions or if you would like to add new services.

| Online Banking | 1 | Direct Deposit | 1 |
|--------------------|---|-----------------------|---|
| Online Bill Pay | 1 | Auto Transfer/Payment | 1 |
| Online Statements | 1 | Overdraft Protection | |
| Mobile Banking | 1 | Debit Card | |
| My Spending Report | 1 | Overdraft Service | П |

M IMPORTANT ACCOUNT INFORMATION

Periodically, we may evaluate the timing of statements, monthly service fee assessment and interest payments to your accounts. We may adjust the timing in order to align your statement, monthly service fee assessment (if any) and interest payment dates with one another. You may receive a partial statement that reflects activity and interest payments from the last statement date to the date of the change. No monthly service fees will be assessed during a partial statement period and there will be no impact to your interest rate or compounding frequency.

Other Wells Fargo Benefits

Students have unique needs when it comes to their money. Whether a younger teen in high school, or an older teen preparing to graduate and take the next step towards college, the military, or directly into the workforce, Wells Fargo has the tools and resources to help students access their money, manage a budget, pay for college, and much more. Visit wellsfargo.com/studentcenter

(389) Sheet Seq = 0006641 Sheet 00001 of 00002



Activity summary

Beginning balance on 2/26
Deposits/Additions
Withdrawals/Subtractions
Ending balance on 3/24

11,891.83

A318.53

A318.53

Ending balance on 3/24

Account number: 1010025493649

HARRY D GURAL

Washington, DC account terms and conditions apply

For Direct Deposit use

Routing Number (RTN): 054001220

Overdraft Protection

This account is not currently covered by Overdraft Protection. If you would like more information regarding Overdraft Protection and eligibility requirements please call the number listed on your statement or visit your Wells Fargo store.

Transaction history

| Totals | | 314.53 | 161773.90 | |
|------------|--|-----------|--|--------------|
| Ending bal | ance on 3/24 | | Contract Con | (5,232.48) |
| 3/23 | Bill Pay Equity Residenti Recurringxxxxxx07071 on 03-23 | | 1,995.00 | 15/232/48 |
| 3/18 | US Senate Fed Salary 031516 xxxxx2309 Harry Gural | 3 657.27) | - THE REAL PROPERTY AND ADDRESS OF THE PERTY ADDRESS | 47,227,48 |
| 3/16 | Gill Pay Ron Cable Recurringxxxxxxx84104 on 63-16 | | (122.21) | (13,570.01 |
| 3/14 | Chase Epay 160313 2556667292 MR Harry D Gura | | 2,189.35 | 63,692,42 |
| 3/14 | (Paypal Inst XIer 160313 Nohomers55 Harry Gural | | 30:00 | |
| 3/10 | Bill Pay Verizon Wireless Recurringxxxxxxxxxxx00001 on 03-19 | | (137/34) | 16:911.77 |
| 3/4 | CUS Senate Fed Salary 022916 xxxxx2309 Harry Gura | (8,657/26 | | CIG:049:4 |
| 3/2 | CBill Pay Chase Card Servi Recurringxxxxxxxxxxxx75225 on 03-02 | | SECTION OF THE PERSON OF THE P | (12,391)8 |
| 3/1) | Recogning Transfer to Gural H Way2Sava Savings Hor | | (30000) | (14,391,85 |
| Date | Number Description | Additions | Subtractions | balance |
| | Check- | Deposits/ | Withdrawals/ | Ending daily |

The Ending Daily Balance does not reflect any pending withdrawals or holds on deposited funds that may have been outstanding on your account when your transactions posted. If you had insufficient available funds when a transaction posted, fees may have been assessed.

Monthly service fee summary

For a complete list of fees and detailed account information, please see the Wells Fargo Fee and Information Schedule and Account Agreement applicable to your account or talk to a banker. Go to wellsfargo.com/feefaq to find answers to common questions about the monthly service fee on your account.

| Fee period 02/26/2016 - 03/24/2016 | Standard monthly service fee \$12.00 | You paid \$0.00 |
|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------|
| How to avoid the monthly service fee | Minimum required | This fee period |
| Have any ONE of the following account requirements | | |
| Average daily balance | \$1,500.00 | \$15,322.00 |
| Monthly automatic payment to a Wells Fargo home mortgage | 1 | 0 🗆 |
| · Combined balances in linked accounts, which may include | \$2,500.00 | \$36,042.82 |
| Average daily balances in checking and savings accounts | | |
| · Combined balances in linked accounts, which may include | \$5,000.00 | \$0.00 |
| - Average daily balances in time accounts and FDIC-insured retirement accounts | counts | |
| · Combined balances in linked accounts, which may include | \$5,000.00 | \$0.00 |
| - Outstanding balances in consumer installment loans | | |

JB/JB

- Line amount in credit cards and consumer lines of credit

EXHIBIT D

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIVIL DIVISION LANDLORD AND TENANT BRANCH

510 4th STREET, N.W., Building B, Room #110, Washington, D.C. 20001 Telephone (202) 879-4879

| | | | | Case No. LTB | |
|--|---|---|--|---|---|
| EQUITY RESIDENTIAL | MANAGEMENT, L.L.C. | | vs. | HARRY GURAL | |
| Plaintiff(s) 3003 Van Ness Street, N | NI W | | | Defendant(s) 3003 Van Ness Street, Apt. S707 | |
| Address (No post of | | | | Address | |
| Washington | DC | 20008 | | Washington, D.C. | 20008 |
| City (202) 452-1400 - counse | State | Zip Code | | | Zip Code |
| Phone Number | , | | | Phone Number (if known) | |
| | | | | OF REAL PROPERTY dential Property) | FORM 1A |
| DISTRICT OF C | | | | | |
| affirm, unde | er penalties of perjur | y, that I have knowled | edge of the fact | ington, D.C. 20008 (202) 244-7811 s set forth in this Complaint an | , swear or d that I am: ☐ Plaintiff, or |
| ☐ Plaintiff's if Plaintiff is a d | attorney, or Plair corporation, include your | ntiff's agent authoriz | zed to make this | s verification and my relationsh rized agent of management company as agent | ip to Plaintiff is (explain, and for owner |
| and is autho | is the Landlord or Overized to take posses demand possession | ssion of the property | n appointed Pe y, or | rsonal Representative of the E e Landlord, Owner, or Person | state in case noal Representative, but has |
| 3. Plaintiff see | ks possession of pro | onerty located at 300 | 03 Van Ness Street, Apt. | . \$707 | , Washington, D.C. |
| Property is i | in possession of Det | fendant, a tenant wh | no holds it without | out right. Plaintiff seeks posses to April 30, 2016 The meeks other fees of \$ for | ssion of property because: onthly rent is \$ 2,192.00 |
| (explain), | , defined as rent und | der paragraph no | of the leas | se (bring lease to every court of the state | late) for this property, |
| Notice to expressly | quit has been: see | erved as required by be served with a no | y law, or ☑ I ha otice to quit in pa | ve personally reviewed the lead aragraph no. 26 on page or document (attach copy). | se and Defendant has |
| If the rent is | e property of which P s subsidized, answer mount of rent, if any | r all of the following: | | zed by the federal or local gov | ernment? ☐ yes ☑ no |
| What ar | mount of rent, if any, | , is due from the sul | osidy program p | plaint over and above the tena | nt's portion of the rent for |
| Has the | subsidy program fa | | ** Plus any other | r any of the months at issue in or amounts that come due during p ion, rent, additional rent (e.g., par | this case? yes no |
| □ Judg | ntiff asks the Court for ment for possession by judgment for rent | of the property des | scribed and cos | ts taxed by the Clerk. commer in the total amount of \$\frac{341.55}{241.55} | ncing as of May 1, 2016 and |
| PDA pro | tective order requiri | ing that all future ren | nt be paid into th | ne Court Registry until the cas | gris decided. |
| 1 3 1 1 5 | worn to before me the | this S day, or man | 11-30-2016 | Praintiff/Plaintiff's Attorney/Plai General Manager of 3003 Van Ness | |
| Notary Public - | RI | My Commission expi | res | Title of Person Signing (if any) | |
| practice of law. Ar unauthorized practic | ny person who is not a ce of law if he or she acts | lawyer in good standin s on behalf of another in | g in the District of the Landlord and Te | cedure 101, and Landlord and Tenan Columbia should be aware that he enant Branch for any purpose other th | or she could be engaging in the |
| Joshua M. Greenberg/D Plaintiff/Plaintiff's At Greenstein DeLorme & Lu | - 17 N | | Bar No. | CLERK OF THE | COURT |
| Address (202) 452-1400 | JMG@GDLLA | Zip w.com/dft@gdllaw.com | Code Co | osts of this suit to date are \$_0 | Top course |
| Phone No. | Email Addre | ess (required only for atto | inleys) | | |